## Tender Number 10/2022 to be carried out through an international consultant, an analysis of the existing competitive procedures in public transport in Israel and abroad – Clarifications and the Ministry's response to clarification questions

Below are the clarifications of the Ministry of Transport and Road Safety (hereinafter: "the Ministry") regarding Tender Number 10/2022 to be carried out through an international consultant, an analysis of the existing competitive procedures in public transport in Israel and abroad (hereinafter: "the Tender") as well as to the clarification questions sent in writing by the bidders until the deadline set for September 8, 2022, at 16:00.

- 1. All clarifications, changes and amendments mentioned in this document shall be considered as if they were included in the Tender documents from the beginning, they will bind the bidders and will be considered an integral part of the Tender and the contractual agreement, unless otherwise stated.
- 2. All terms and expression mentioned in this document will have the same interpretation as stated in the Tender documents.
- 3. Do not rely on any explanation or interpretation given orally or in writing or in any other way by someone on behalf of the Ministry or the Tender Committee, insofar as possible, in any forum or form. The only changes from what is stated in the Tender documents as well as all the interpretations and clarifications thereof, are as detailed in this document only and in additional clarification documents that will be published on behalf of the Tenders Committee in writing, insofar as they are published.
- 4. What is stated in this document does not change or detract from what is stated in the Tender documents, unless explicitly stated otherwise.
- 5. In any case of contradiction between the instructions of this clarification document and the Tender documents, the clarification document shall prevail.

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section / Subsection No.	Detail of the requested question / clarification	Suggested answer
1	Threshold condition	4.2.2 (Third line in the section)	In this section it says "and/or" regarding the requested experience in tenders and the requested experience in research. Please clarify what you mean by the phrase "and/or". Does it mean that the experience can relate to only one of the fields? For example, only experience accompanying tenders and not research?	The wording "and/or" allows the presentation of experience only in accompanying tenders or only in the publication of applied research. In addition, it allows an experience that combines both.  See also the end of section 4.4.4 of the Tender, in which it was set forth that "one tender and one study can be presented".
2	Threshold condition	4.2.2	<ul> <li>Applied research almost never undergoes formal peer review, as they are not intended for academic publication. Please clarify your intention.</li> <li>A. Do you mean peer-reviewed academic studies or for applied research for the mentioned public bodies?</li> <li>B. Is it possible to submit a candidate who has experience in relevant applied studies that have been carried out with no formal peer review?</li> <li>C. Please define what will be considered peer review.</li> </ul>	Alone with the answer to question no. 4, section 4.2.2 will be updated as following: "Has experience in at least two countries/authorities in OECD countries (excluding Israel) in writing and/or accompanying central and significant public transport bus tenders with an annual financial volume not less than 50 million dollars or euros (each) and/or publication of at least two applied studies in the field of bus tenders in public transport, for local, metropolitan or government authorities in the ten years preceding the date of submission of the Request."
3	Threshold condition	4.2	We have contacted a large number of international consultants, both with an academic background and a professional background. Of these, the professional consultants lack an academic background, and the academic consultants lack professional experience. Therefore, we wish to convert the international consultant into a team of consultants which will consist of a consultant with professional experience - who will be the leading consultant, and a consultants(s) with an academic background who published articles on competitive procedures in buses.	There is no change in the Tender documents. Without detracting from the aforementioned, Bidders' attention is directed to the quality rating detailed in section 7.2 of the Tender in relation to additional staff members.

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section / Subsection No.	Detail of the requested question / clarification	Suggested answer
4	Threshold condition	4.2.2 The financial scope of a Tender is USD 80 million per year	Since we contacted a large number of international consultants it seems that this threshold condition sets too high a bar for the scope of activity for a competitive procedure for buses. It is understood that the Committee's wish is to sort out experience in small-scale tenders such as small communities and educational institutions, therefore, we request to convert the threshold condition to competitive procedures in cities with a population of at least 0.5 million inhabitants.	Alone with the answer to question no. 2, section 4.2.2 will be updated as following: "Has experience in at least two countries/authorities in OECD countries (excluding Israel) in writing and/or accompanying central and significant public transport bus tenders with an annual financial volume not less than 50 million dollars or euros (each) and/or publication of at least two applied studies in the field of bus tenders in public transport, for local, metropolitan or government authorities in the ten years preceding the date of submission of the Request."
5	Threshold condition	4.4.2, 4.2.2	Is there a minimum residency requirement for the international consultant in Israel?	The international consultant will actually manage all work phases; therefore, the Bidder must consider that the consultant will be required to come to Israel as much as necessary for this purpose, and in order to fulfill all the conditions of the procedure in the most optimal way, including the presentation of the recommendations of the work subject to the Tender.
6		7.2	The Israeli accompanying consultant is required to accompany the foreign consultant with regard to the local market and tender procedures in Israel, which have unique characteristics in terms of the Tender Law, its regulations, instructions and rulings. In addition, the consultant is required to accompany the foreign consultant in aspects of applied studies in the local market - XX.  Please give an equivalent or even higher quality score to the consultant, who:  Has experience in the field of tenders in Israel - writing, editing, planning;  Has experience in policy studies in Israel - writing, editing, planning.	There is no change in the Tender documents.

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section / Subsection No.	Detail of the requested question / clarification	Suggested answer
7	Additional non- mandatory staff members	4.5	We would like to state that the aforementioned systems engineering methodology will also be added to the relevant experience and that the sentence "accompanying and submitting public transport tenders" will be amended to "accompanying and submitting or inspecting public transport tenders".	There is no change in the Tender documents.
8		5.3	Please update the reference - it seems as if section 19.2 is not related to the text of the reference.	Accepted. At the beginning of section 5.3, the reference is updated to section 20.2.
9	Chapter B: Description of the Requested Work	6. The manner of performing the Work  Section 6.7 Non-compete limitation	Section 6.7 states that "In addition, the winner, the international consultant and the Israeli consultant will not be allowed to engage, directly or indirectly, in providing services to Bidders in the competitive procedures for operating bus service lines in Israel during the year following the submission of the final report."  The Committee is requested to confirm that the limitation will only apply to consulting services provided to bidders, for and as part of competing in tenders for operating bus service lines in Israel only.	The wording of section 6.7 will be updated so the winner, the international consultant and the Israeli consultant will not be allowed to engage, directly or indirectly, in providing any service to any entity that has a valid license from the Traffic Inspector and to bidders in competitive procedures for granting licenses for bus service lines, for one year after the final report." The beginning of section 6.7 shall remain unchanged.
10	Quality rating of the international consultant	7.2. Points for experience in additional tenders beyond the threshold conditions	We wish to convert the condition to competitive procedures in cities with a population of at least 0.5 million inhabitants.	There is no change in the Tender documents.

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section / Subsection No.	Detail of the requested question / clarification	Suggested answer
11	Quality rating of the international consultant	7.2. Publication of applied research	We would like to allow the experience of additional consultant(s) and not just one international consultant.	There is no change in the Tender documents.
12	General – Reference documents	General		The content of the work and the threshold conditions in section 4.2.2 of the tender refer to <u>buses</u> service lines.
13	Chapter A, Chapter B	Required work content	Further to the question presented here (# 1), is the maximum points criteria only valid for showing experience with public transport in bus names or maybe the points will be given to those with global and broad experience in public transport in the broadest sense of the subject (light rail, metro, trains)?	See answer to question no. 12. The threshold conditions and criteria for quality rating refer to public buses transport only.
14	Option for consultation by hours	13.4	We would like to clarify the hourly rate - The contract rates with external service providers include several types of rates. In addition, we request that the rate for the foreign consultant be the General Accountant's rate for management consultants plus 20%.	There is no change in the Tender documents.
15		Appendix A	Please attach the Contractual Agreement and enable an appropriate time for further sending of clarification questions.	The Contractual Agreement is attached.
16		Appendix J	In Appendix J, Section 2, there is a reference to Section 4.3.2 in the Tender documents, however this section does not exist. Section 4.3 of the Tender documents regarding the threshold conditions for an Israeli consultant/accompanying entity does not specify the required experience. Please clarify what experience is required of the Israeli consultant/accompanying entity.	Section 2 of Appendix J will be amended; thus the reference will be to Section 7.2 of the Tender. Beyond the amendment of the aforementioned reference, there is no change in the Tender documents.

- 6. Attached is Appendix A to the Tender documents The Contractual Agreement.
- 7. The dates specified in Section 3 of the Tender documents will be updated in accordance with the following:

	<u>Date</u>	<u>Time</u>
Deadline for sending clarification questions	6.10.2022	Till 16:00
regarding to changing the threshold conditions		
Deadline for submitting Bids	7.11.2022	From 09:00 till 12:00

- 8. It is hereby clarified and emphasized that there is no change in the validity of the Tender guarantee, as published in the Tender documents 25.04.2023.
- 9. All provisions applicable to the original date will apply to the updated date, as detailed in the Tender.